

Part 1: Allow or Not Allow Billboards? Tally of votes from Homework 2

Note: the left hand column tallies the votes of those weighing in on each zone, and notes whether the votes reach a Consensus level (80% of those voting) or Recommendation level (60-79% of those voting) in the CWG Charter. **It is not intended to reflect a final decision or recommendation of the CWG since not all CWG members completed the homework and not everyone voted on each zone.**

Initial Voting Consensus (C)/ or Recommendation (R)?	NOT ALLOW	ALLOW	# Billbrds	Zone	Zone Name, description
		2	ALL ZONES – and decide case by case if appropriate or not		
Residential Zones (3 total billboards)					
C-- do not allow ?	Assumed not allowed in homework.	0	R-1	Single-Family Dwelling District. Low-density urban residential neighborhood.	
		2	R-2	Single-Family Dwelling District. Residential, slightly higher density than R-1.	
		0	R-2SRD	Residential Special Review District. Allows limited number of 2 & 3 family dwellings.	
		0	HMR-SRD	Historic Mixed Residential Special Review District. Mostly single-family dwellings, some allowance for 2 & 3 family dwellings, some pre-existing multi-family.	
		0	R-3	Two-Family Dwelling District. Allows 2 & 3 family dwellings.	
		0	R-4L	Low Density Multiple-Family Dwelling District. Low density. 35 ft. height limit	
		1	R-4	Multiple Family Dwelling District. Medium density. 60 ft. height limit.	
		0	R-5	Multiple Family Dwelling District. High density. 150 ft. height limit.	
Downtown Zones (38 total billboards)					
	2	5	5	DCC	Downtown Commercial Core. High rise office, hotels, public services, retail, residential, educational and limited industrial. 400 ft. height limit.
	2	5	5	DMU	Downtown Mixed-Use District. Mid-rise office, hotels, education, residential, cultural and limited industrial. 100 ft. height limit.
	3	5	10	DR	Downtown Residential. Mid-rise urban residential development, some employment and retail. 90 ft. height limit
R allow	2	6	18	WR	Warehouse Residential District. Mix of residential, office, retail, education, and industrial. 100 ft. height limit.

Initial Voting Consensus (C)/ or Recommendation (R)?	NOT ALLOW	ALLOW	# Billbrds	Zone	Zone Name, description
Commercial Zones (121 total billboards)					
	2	4	10	T	Transitional District. Primarily office and personal service uses. 35 ft. height limit.
R allow	3	7	4	C-1	General Neighborhood Commercial District. Low intensity, smaller scale retail, office, and personal services. 35 ft. height limit.
C allow	2	9	107	C-2	General Community Commercial District. Similar to C-1, but intended to serve a larger market area. Higher intensity, larger scale uses. 45 ft. height limit.
C allow	1	6	0	PDB	Planned Development Business District. Mix of non-residential uses, generally designed as an “office/commercial park.” 45 ft. height limit.
Mixed-Use Center Zones (66 total billboards) “...create spaces where people can work, live, walk, shop, play, eat...accommodate alternative transportation...” Residential uses and creation of compact, pedestrian-friendly, multi-modal districts is encouraged.					
	4	5	35	NCX	Neighborhood Commercial Mixed-Use District. Pedestrian-oriented neighborhood shopping areas with retail, office, restaurants and residential uses. 45 ft. height limit with bonus program.
R allow	2	7	12	CCX	Community Commercial Mixed-Use District. Commercial and retail serving people from throughout city, along with residential uses. 60 ft. height limit with bonus program.
R allow	2	7	2	UCX	Urban Center Mixed-Use District. Highest densities outside of central business district. Mix of commercial and residential uses. 75 ft. height limit with bonus program.
	6	5	1	RCX	Residential Commercial Mixed-Use District. Primarily multi-family residential district with some commercial uses. 60 ft. height limit with bonus program.
C allow	1	6	11	CIX	Commercial Industrial Mixed-Use District. Commercial, light industrial and residential uses. 75 ft. height limit with bonus program.
	6	5	0	NRX	Neighborhood Residential Mixed-Use District. Primarily residential, moderate density, discourages removal of single family structures. 35 ft. height limit.
	4	5	0	URX	Urban Residential Mixed-Use District. Primarily residential. Transition between more intense mixed-use and lower density residential areas. 45 ft. height limit.
	2	6	0	HMX	Hospital Medical Mixed-Use District. Contains hospitals and similar large scale medical facilities. 150 ft. height limit.

Initial Voting Consensus (C)/ or Recommendation (R)?	NOT ALLOW	ALLOW	# Billbrds	Zone	Zone Name, description
Industrial Zones (87 total billboards)					
C allow	0	11	45	M-1	Light Industrial District. Warehouse and light industrial uses. 75 ft. height limit.
C allow	0	11	29	M-2	Heavy Industrial District. Heavy industrial uses. 100 ft. height limit.
C allow	0	11	8	PMI	Port Maritime and Industrial District. Heavy industrial uses, with focus on marine related and support facilities. 100 ft. height limit, with allowances for more.
Shoreline Zones (6 total billboards)					
"The shorelines of Tacoma have great social, ecological, recreational, cultural, economic and aesthetic value."					
C do not allow	9	0	2	S9	There are 17 shoreline districts (district numbers do not correlate to density). Depending on the portion of the shoreline, they range from natural areas and park areas, to residential and commercial areas, to the heavy industrial areas in the Port Tideflats. In most, the maximum building height is 35 ft., but in some it may go up to 100 feet.
C do not allow	9	0	4	S10	
Overlay Zones					
<i>(billboard count in this section duplicates count above)</i>					
C do not allow	5	0	0	VSD	View Sensitive Overlay District. Established to protect views through reduced height limit. Mostly residential areas. 25 ft. height limit.
	1	2	61	ST-M/IC	South Tacoma Manufacturing/Industrial Center Overlay District. Designed to protect industrial and manufacturing uses in South Tacoma & Nalley Valleys.
C do not allow	5	0	0	HIST	Historical Special Review Overlay District. To protect historic fabric. Generally prevents demolition and requires design review for new buildings and remodels to existing ones.
C do not allow	5	0	5	CONS	Conservation Overlay District. Protection of historic resources and traditional development patterns. Generally prevents demolition and requires design review for new buildings.
C do not allow	2	0	112	STGPD	South Tacoma Groundwater Protection District. Focused on controlling hazardous substances in this area to protect aquifer.

Other location related considerations mentioned:

Don't allow in:	Allow in:
Any "beautiful routes" in the city	These arterials: 72nd, 56 th , 38 th , Center ST., 27 th , 19 th , 6 th , Pearl, Proctor, 21 st , S. Tacoma Way
Anywhere a driver would be distracted	Major thoroughfares
Any area visible from a neighborhood	Next to Mall
Next to schools	
Residential streets	
Within line of site of existing houses	Horizontal surfaces, not visible from streets, 2" high
Where a structure could fall, causing injury or death	Everywhere—make decision case by base, not based on where they were originally permitted and compensate landowners and sign owners for any signs forcibly removed.
Any zone, anywhere	
Eventually, I feel all billboards should be removed as they are harmful to the quality of life in Tacoma	
Other observations/questions	
Should the assumption that R-4 and R-5 are zones where billboards are not allowed be revisited?	
Cookie cutter approach won't work—we should look at each sub-district and say yes or no, with limitations.	

Other "How do we get there from here" ideas:

	Swapping out of Boards in forbidden zones should bet an instant green light permit from the city with a relocation into o.k. zones. Swap outs should carry a \$2500 fee that goes directly into a "fix potholes" fund as people who see billboards are mainly roadway drivers
	CCO should make available 'run of market" space available for promoting city features such as the farmers market, ethnic fair, zoo & aquarium, city events—on buses and billboards. 4 faces per month & 10 cards transit a month.
	Since a lot of Tacoma is on the historical register, it would be great to see it be a billboard free zone. You could grandfather all other billboards in the City as long as they are kept up and not permit an increase in the total number. In return for that, each community defined neighborhood/business district, which I believe we have 15, would receive a beautification art project from Clear Channel. If they can afford to give nonprofits a break in advertising, they can afford to work with each neighborhood/business district on outdoor artwork, not to exceed a certain agreed upon amount.

Part 2: Other Factors Important to CWG Members

Item	Detail	Ranking – # of times mentioned with this rank					Other/comments associated with these items
		#1	#2	#3	#4-7	Not very important	
Design	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 faces per structure, max. • No offset or cantilevered construction of structure 		1	2	1 (2 faces max) 1 (1 face max)	2-- Cantilevered construction 1-- 2011 codes 3.b-g 2—max 2 faces per structure	Only allow monochromatic design.
Digital Signs	Not allowed	4	1	1		1 –allow with brightness restrictions	
Height	35 ft.; 45 ft. in PMI zone Not above a building		2	4	3		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scale to surrounding environment • Allowed height should be relative to building heights allowed in zone • Not taller than 25 ft. except in PMI district • 2 inch height, laying flat on horizontal surfaces that cannot be seen from streets
Size	300 sq. ft. max. (no “Premier” or “Bulletin” sizes allowed)	1	4	3	1	1—as long as in scale with surroundings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Size should be scaled to street speed. • <i>Nowhere >300s. ft. except possibly on SR 509 in PMI</i> • Billboard sizes can vary depending on zone, height and buffering • Smaller signs preferred • No larger than poster size(<300 sq feet)
Dispersal	500 ft. minimum between billboard structures				3	1 -- could be tossed to gain other benefits	

Item	Detail	Ranking – # of times mentioned with this rank					Other/comments associated with these items
		#1	#2	#3	#4-7	Not very important	
Buffering	No billboard within 500 ft. of residential, mixed use, special use areas (Note: this requirement eliminates most billboards even in otherwise allowable zones)	1			2		500 feet from Residential districts, historic, conservation, shoreline. Don't require buffering for X districts, religious institutions or schools. Not w/in 200 feet of residential, mixed us, special use zones. Reduce buffer to residential zones to 250 feet, but no billboard may be viewable from any residential unit
Set back	Minimum 10 feet from street frontage				2	1 – as long as not hanging over road	
Other							
Total Number of Faces							
Absolute number of billboards or billboard faces		1				1	
Content Regulation							
Content regulation—never show alcohol, drugs, other content consideration				2			
No company would be allowed to place politically charged statements on any billboard without providing free equal time. At a billboard location of the opposing views choice					1		
Maintenance Related Issues							
Billboard maintenance			1	1	3		
Landscaping					2	1- 5 foot buffer	
Always have copy (no blank billboards/backs)					2		
Relocation							
Relocation Rights (into zones & buffers)			2				

Item	Detail	Ranking – # of times mentioned with this rank					Other/comments associated with these items
		#1	#2	#3	#4-7	Not very important	
<i>Other takes on “location” issues</i>							
	No illumination spillover into residential zones		1				
	No blocking a scenic view—mountains, hillsides with lots of trees, water	1					
	Not over buildings, too close to buildings				1		
	Nothing on top of a building; ok on side if windows not covered				1		
	No billboards visible from a residential zone			1			
	If a billboard is proposed, the final decision would be given to the community that is within 5,280 feet of the location				1		
	Eventual removal of all billboards	1					
	Not important that current code limits BB to only 4 zones—this is too restrictive. In my opinion, we should have at least twice as many.					1	
<i>Permits, Licensing & Fees</i>							
	All property owners renting out space for billboards must hold a current city business license; make least agreement part of license condition and public record			1			
	Fees per billboard & fines for those not maintained—tracking fines by company, not billboard				1		
	Billboard fees are much too low				1		
	Permits with fixed terms (10-15 yrs) and no compensation if city declines to renew the permit; Billboard owners will not be compensated more than actual installation costs in event of condemnation before the term expires				1		

Item	Detail	Ranking – # of times mentioned with this rank					Other/comments associated with these items
		#1	#2	#3	#4-7	Not very important	
	Make it easier to cancel landlord-BB agreements – 30-60 days’ notice by either party				1		
	Enforcement mechanism for noncompliant signs				1		
	Property Rights of Billboard Owners						
	Vested Rights	2					
	Not important that negative impacts on sign owners be mitigated over a term of years					1	
	Not important that some don’t like billboards— calling something “blight” not legitimate reason for taking them from commercial property owners					1	
	Other thoughts						
	Identify the dirty dozen most hated boards, pay a fair market value to the leaseholders and sign companies.	1					
	Not important that city and local nonprofits have free or low cost access					1	
	Make run of market space available for city programs –4 faces per month, 10 transit cards/month.				1		
	Not important that out-of-town corporations have access to billboards					1	
	Need to not set up so many restrictions that other media will be jeopardized (signage, advertising, transit ads, etc.)	1					
	Freedom of speech		1				
	Fascism			1			